

## From Bose-Einstein to “correct Boltzmann counting” for indistinguishable particles?

The total number of arrangements of  $N$  indistinguishable particles among  $k$  energy levels with  $g_i$  states in level  $i$  such that  $n_i$  particles are in level  $i$  is:

$$W = \prod_{i=1}^k \frac{(n_i + g_i - 1)!}{n_i! (g_i - 1)!}$$

A single factor in this product written without index becomes:

$$W = \frac{(n + g - 1)!}{n! (g - 1)!}$$

Assuming  $g \gg n \gg 1$  and using Stirling's approximation  $\ln x! \approx x \ln x - x$  in the form  $x! \approx x^x e^{-x}$  a few times and  $e^x \approx 1 + x$  once gives:

$$\begin{aligned} W &= \frac{(n + g - 1)!}{n! (g - 1)!} \approx \frac{(n + g)!}{n! g!} \approx \frac{(n + g)^{n+g} e^{-(n+g)}}{n^n e^{-n} g^g e^{-g}} = \frac{(n + g)^{n+g}}{n^n g^g} = \frac{g^n (n + g)^{n+g}}{n^n g^{n+g}} \\ &= \frac{g^n \left(\frac{n}{g} + 1\right)^{n+g}}{n^n} \approx \frac{g^n \left(e^{\frac{n}{g}}\right)^{n+g}}{n^n} = \frac{g^n e^{\frac{n^2}{g}} e^n}{n^n} = \frac{g^n e^{\frac{n^2}{g}}}{n^n e^{-n}} \approx \frac{g^n}{n!} e^{\frac{n^2}{g}} \end{aligned}$$