

To Prove:

$$\forall x[\forall y(y \in x \leftrightarrow y \in x) \wedge \forall y(x \in y \leftrightarrow x \in y)] \quad (1)$$

First we show that the following is provable:

$$\forall x(\forall y[x \in y \leftrightarrow x \in y \wedge y \in x \leftrightarrow y \in x]) \quad (2)$$

Proof

1. $x \in y \leftrightarrow x \in y \wedge y \in x \leftrightarrow y \in x$ Tautology.
2. $\forall x(\forall y[x \in y \leftrightarrow x \in y \wedge y \in x \leftrightarrow y \in x])$ By universal closure of propositional tautologies.

Now, if we could show the following:

$$\forall x[\forall y(\phi \wedge \psi)] \rightarrow \forall x(\forall y\phi \wedge \forall y\psi) \quad (3)$$

we could, by making the relevant substitutions for ϕ and ψ , use 2 to derive 1.

To do this, first consider proving the easier (but still fiddly):

$$\forall y(\phi y \wedge \psi y) \rightarrow (\forall y\phi y \wedge \forall y\psi y) \quad (4)$$

Proof sketch:

1. $\forall y\phi y \rightarrow [\forall y\psi y \rightarrow (\forall y\phi y \wedge \forall y\psi y)]$ Taut
2. $(\phi y \wedge \psi y) \rightarrow \phi y$ Taut
3. $\forall y[(\phi y \wedge \psi y) \rightarrow \phi y] \rightarrow [\forall y(\phi y \wedge \psi y) \rightarrow \forall y\phi y]$ Axiom 3
4. $\forall y[(\phi y \wedge \psi y) \rightarrow \phi y]$ closure of 2 (which is a taut)
5. $\forall y(\phi y \wedge \psi y) \rightarrow \forall y\phi y$ 4 3 MP
6. $(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow [(B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow (A \rightarrow C)]$ (where A is the antecedent of 5, B is the consequent of 5, and C is the consequent of 1) Tautology.
7. $(B \rightarrow C) \rightarrow (A \rightarrow C)$ 5 6 MP
8. $A \rightarrow C$ 1 7 MP
9. $\forall y(\phi y \wedge \psi y) \rightarrow (\forall y\psi y \rightarrow [\forall y\phi y \wedge \forall y\psi y])$ Above line with A and C written out in full.

10. $\phi y \wedge \psi y \rightarrow \psi y$ Taut.
11. then basically repeat the steps above to eliminate the middle term in 9 to get the result:
12. $\forall y(\phi y \wedge \psi y) \rightarrow (\forall y\phi y \wedge \forall y\psi y)$

Using the ideas in this proof, we can show:

$$\forall x(\forall y(\phi y \wedge \psi y) \rightarrow (\forall y\phi y \wedge \forall y\psi y)) \quad (5)$$

We do this by piggybacking on the above proof: we effectively follow it, but repeatedly performing closure on the tautologies above, and axiom 3 which allows us to repeatedly distribute \forall across conditionals.

Proof sketch.

1. $\forall y\phi y \rightarrow [\forall y\psi y \rightarrow (\forall y\phi y \wedge \forall y\psi y)]$ Taut
2. $\forall z[\forall y\phi y \rightarrow [\forall y\psi y \rightarrow (\forall y\phi y \wedge \forall y\psi y)]]$ closure of tautology at 1.
3. $(\phi y \wedge \psi y) \rightarrow \phi y$ Taut
4. $\forall z(\forall y[(\phi y \wedge \psi y) \rightarrow \phi y])$ a closure of above tautology
5. $\forall y[(\phi y \wedge \psi y) \rightarrow \phi y] \rightarrow [\forall y(\phi y \wedge \psi y) \rightarrow \forall y\phi y]$ Axiom 3
6. $\forall z(\forall y[(\phi y \wedge \psi y) \rightarrow \phi y] \rightarrow [\forall y(\phi y \wedge \psi y) \rightarrow \forall y\phi y])$ closure of above Axiom
7. $\forall z(\forall y[(\phi y \wedge \psi y) \rightarrow \phi y]) \rightarrow \forall z[\forall y(\phi y \wedge \psi y) \rightarrow \forall y\phi y]$ Use 6, axiom 3, and Modus Ponens.
8. $\forall z[\forall y(\phi y \wedge \psi y) \rightarrow \forall y\phi y]$ 4 7 MP.
9. So, with effort, we have managed to get the closure of 5 of the previous proof, which we couldn't do directly.
10. Keep taking closures of tautologies and distributing $\forall z$ as in the move from 6 to 7, to mimic the earlier proof - it's a lot of steps, but one should end up with the theorem.